
**NORTHWEST MICHIGAN COUNCIL OF GOVERNMENTS
NORTHWEST MICHIGAN WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT BOARD
Joint Board Meeting**

Monday, November 8, 2010

MEETING MINUTES

Roll Call – COG

Present: M. Crawford, Antrim County; D. Tanner, Benzie County; C. Christensen, Charlevoix County; L. Atchison, Emmet County; L. Inman, G.T. County; L. Nemeth, Kalkaska County; J. Watkoski, Leelanau County; A. O’Shea, Manistee County; S. Rogers, Missaukee County; L. Copley, Wexford County
Absent: none

Roll Call - WDB

Present: D. Adams, E. Bachman, K. Bollman, T. Breithaupt, C. Dillon, J. Dunbar, D. Eichberger, G. Fedus, A. Jeannot, N. Kalchik, J. Korthase, K. Osborne, D. Parkes, S. Perdue, S. Peters, P. Ward
Absent: J. Barnard, C. Case, G. Crum, G. Kaminski, L. Mitchell, C. Pettibone, D. Pratt, J. Rives, M. Ryan, J. Smith, J. Toth, D. Van Houten

Guests present: Charles Koop, Antrim County Civil Counsel

Staff present: Elaine Wood, CEO; Denise Culman, Administrative Assistant

Call to Order

Dave Adams and Larry Inman, Chairmen, called the joint meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. on Monday, November 8, 2010 at the Traverse City *Michigan Works!* Center. Introductions were made around the room.

Approval of Agenda

Larry Inman, Chairman COG Board, asked if there needed to be any changes to the agenda; hearing none, he asked for a motion to approve the agenda by COG Board.

COG

Motion by J. Watkoski, supported by A. O’Shea to approve the agenda as presented.
Motion carried unanimously.

Dave Adams, WDB Chairman, asked if there needed to be any changes to the agenda; hearing none, he asked for a motion to approve the agenda by WDB.

WDB

Motion by C. Dillon, supported by D. Parkes to approve the agenda as presented.
Motion carried unanimously.

COG Minutes of August, 2010

Larry asked if there were any changes needed to August, 2010 minutes of the NWMCOG Board, which were mailed earlier for review. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the minutes.

Motion by L. Atchison, supported by L. Nemeth, to approve the minutes from August, 2010 meeting.
Motion carried unanimously.

WDB Minutes of October, 2010

Dave asked if there were any changes needed to October, 2010 minutes of the Workforce Development Board, which were mailed earlier for review. There being none, he asked for a motion to approve the minutes.

Motion by D. Parkes, supported by A. Jeannot, to approve the minutes from October, 2010 meeting.
Motion carried unanimously.

Public Comment

No public comment.

Financial Report

Elaine Wood, CEO went over a few of the items of the Amended Budget for FY10 and Expenditures through September 30, 2010. Questions were answered.

WDB

Motion by C. Dillon, supported by D. Parkes to approve the financial report as presented.
Motion carried unanimously.

COG

Motion by J. Watkoski, supported by A. O'Shea to approve the financial report as presented.
Motion carried unanimously.

Dave distributed a summary of the workforce development performance report for the year ending 9/30/10 and explained that this information was just received last Friday so it wasn't included in the packet. He noted that in every performance category, the Northwest region outperformed the state average. Elaine touched on a couple of the statistics of performance, and explained that this would be on the next agenda for the WDB to go over it in more detail.

Appointments to the Northwest Alliance for Sustainable Communities (NASC) Board of Directors

Larry said appointments by both board need to be made to this board and he asked Elaine to explain in more detail. This is a new private non-profit entity that resulted from one of the joint board retreats a few years back. The board is comprised of approximately 1/3 of the COG Board and 1/3 of the Workforce Board. It will probably meet only twice a year.

COG is not eligible for some grants because it is a public act 7 entity, and some of the grants that Regional Planning and Economic Development would like to apply for can only be received by a private non-profit. One of the first reasons it was formed was to be eligible for a grant from Kellogg Foundation related to Grand Vision activities, part of which will be to develop a housing trust fund for workforce housing that will probably start this winter. When the 501c3 was formed in November 2008, the board members were appointed at the boards' joint meeting. Since some are no longer on the board, COG needs to appoint one new member and WDB needs to appoint 3 new members.

Larry asked Les Atchison if he was willing to serve on the NASC board, and he said yes.

COG

Motion by C. Christensen, supported by D. Tanner to appoint L. Atchison to the Northwest Alliance for Sustainable Communities Board. Motion carried unanimously.

Dave asked if Sue Peters, Nathan Kalchik, and Don Eichberger would be willing to serve on the NASC board. All indicated they would.

WDB

Motion by D. Parkes, supported by C. Dillon to appoint S. Peters, N. Kalchik, & D. Eichberger to serve on the Northwest Alliance for Sustainable Communities Board.
Motion carried unanimously.

2011 Meeting schedules

Larry talked about the meeting schedule and how November 14th is the start of deer hunting. They asked if the date should be changed to November 21st from November 14th. After some discussion it was felt that it wouldn't make any difference to change the date because that would still be deer hunting week. It was mentioned that the schedule could be amended later in the year, so it was decided to leave the date for now. Larry asked for a motion.

a. COG Board

Motion by D. Tanner, supported by S. Rogers, to approve the 2011 COG Board meeting schedule as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

Dave pointed out that one meeting date was changed on the WDB schedule from the normal practice; instead of Monday, February 14th - Valentines Day- it would be Tuesday, February 15th so everyone could have the evening with their family. The dates for the annual board retreat have been changed as well, based on input from this year's retreat participants.

b. Workforce Development Board

Motion by C. Dillon, supported by K. Osborn, to approve the 2011 WDB meeting schedule as presented.
Motion carried unanimously.

Salary study process and board chairs' recommendations for action steps

Larry introduced Sue Peters to talk about the CEO Salary Study. He wanted to make sure everyone knew she received no compensation for the salary study. Sue provided a thorough review of the Salary Study and its recommendations. Sue answered several questions about the process. With respect to the recommendations, questions were asked about whether the placement of the salary below or above the median based on experience is the standard practice. Sue said it is, and several WDB members stated that this is the standard practice in their companies.

Larry stated that the minutes of the June 2010 COG Board meeting did not properly reflect the members present or the roll call vote on the salary study recommendation. He referenced the amended minutes from the board packet and asked for the amended COG Board minutes of June 18, 2010 to be approved with the addition of the roll call vote, roll call attendance, and spelling error corrected.

Motion by D. Tanner, supported by L. Copley to approve the amended minutes of June 18, 2010 as presented. Motion carried unanimously.

Larry and Dave then went over a brief review of how NWMCOG is structured, including the required partnership of the elected officials (one from each county) and the Workforce Development Board. They asked Elaine to review some of the details of how the organization is structured, the counties' consolidation of the Northwest Michigan Employment and Training Consortium and the Northwest Michigan Regional Planning and Development Commission in the mid 1980s for a single administration, and the other ways in which this COG is different from other Michigan Works or Regional Planning agencies in the state. Elaine reviewed the history of and reasons for the consolidated administration and the number of different programs that are operated under this approach, unlike other regions of the state.

Larry reported that he and Dave Adams had become aware that the Antrim County Board Chair, Jack White, was unhappy with the process used at the June 2010 meeting. When asked by Larry for his specific concerns, Jack expressed to him that there were problems with the minutes as described above, and he thought all ten board members should have been present for the vote. Larry reported that during his conversation with Jack, he said that the minutes would be amended, and he would recommend to the COG Board that a motion be made to put the CEO Salary Study back on the table for discussion, thereby nullifying the previous vote and giving the board an opportunity to re-discuss the topic with all ten members present. Additionally, the WDB members would also be present for the discussion and their own vote on the matter. He asked Jack if these steps would satisfy him and Jack said yes.

Larry reminded board members that the proper way for such a motion to be handled is that two COG board members, present at the June meeting and voting in the affirmative on the original vote, needed to move and second for a motion to reconsider and nullify the vote that occurred on June 18, 2010.

Motion by J. Watkoski, supported by, L. Atchison to reconsider the previous vote of June 18, 2010 regarding the Executive Director/CEO salary study recommendation of \$130,000 retroactive to January 1, 2010, which will nullify the previous vote.

D. Tanner and C. Christiansen expressed disapproval of this recommendation and motion. They stated that this undermines the democratic process, the board's integrity, and opens the door for any future votes by the board to be questioned and reopened. They stated that they had both been No votes on the original motion in June, but did not intend to vote for this motion to reconsider for these reasons. There was considerable discussion among the board members regarding this issue. Board members asked if this motion is defeated, would the previous motion stand, and Larry said yes, but also asked Charles Koop from the audience to verify, which he did. Board members asked Mr. Koop for his opinion as to the discussion raised by D. Tanner and C. Christiansen, and he stated that he believed they made a good point. He was asked if the board were to choose to defeat the motion to reconsider, would he have any problem with that on behalf of Antrim County, and he stated that he would not.

Elaine Wood stated that, out of respect for Antrim County, she would have no problem at all with the June vote being reconsidered.

Larry asked for a roll call vote.

COG Board Roll Call Vote:

Yes votes: J. Watkoski & M. Crawford

No Votes: L. Atchison, L. Nemeth, L. Copley, C. Christensen, S. Rogers, A. O'Shea, D. Tanner, L. Inman

Motion failed, 2 Yes, 8 No.

Dave then opened the salary study for discussion by the WDB. He read a letter from WDB member Dave Pratt that he sent because he wasn't able to attend the meeting. The letter stated that he supports the recommendation of the salary study.

Motion by C. Dillon, supported by K. Osborn approving the recommendation of the salary study for the current CEO's salary of \$130,000 retroactive to January 1, 2010.

Discussion took place around the table. Several board members had positive comments for Elaine and her performance and that she deserves that pay she is receiving based on her experience and performance.

Workforce Development Board Roll Call Vote:

Yes votes: D. Adams, E. Bachman, K. Bollman, T. Breithaupt, C. Dillon, J. Dunbar, D. Eichberger, G. Fedus, A. Jeannot, N. Kalchik, J. Korthase, K. Osborn, D. Parkes, S. Perdue, P. Ward

No votes: 0

Abstain: S. Peters

Vote passes with 15 yes, 0 no, and 1 abstain.

Art Jeannot expressed to Dave that a salary study is not about someone's performance, it is also about equity with comparable positions and other factors, and that he thought it was unfair that Dave had positioned the issue to be about Elaine's performance. Dave thanked Art for his comments.

A few other comments were made about the integrity of the board's democratic process. Larry added that he wanted to make sure that if one of the member counties has an issue, concern or questions about the COG they feel free to bring it up at any time. Their opinion and relationship is very important to the boards. Larry feels he has addressed the issues that were important to Jack White, and this process has also shown how positive everyone feels about Elaine Wood and the job she is doing.

Correspondence

Correspondence was included with the packet. Elaine informed the board of a large number of jobs at a privately owned prison in Baldwin by GEO Group which received a big contract from the state of California. They are expanding their capacity from about 1,700 to about 2,800. They will be adding 400-500 new jobs within the next 18-24 months. This will provide jobs for residents of our southern tier of counties and she will be working closely with West Central Michigan Works on the hiring processes.

Elaine said that this would be the last meeting for this calendar year, and three of the COG board members would not be back next year. She wanted to thank them for their devotion to the COG – Alan O'Shea, Larry Copley & Lou Nemeth. All three have been wonderful board members, challenging, asking great questions, and supporting the organization. She and the other board members thanked them and wished them the best.

Other

Elaine stated that, although she has been providing an orientation session for new board members, it has not been mandatory. She believes we need to have a much more substantial and mandatory orientation process for new board members since the organization is complex and unique. She asked if part of the COG Board's February 2011 meeting could be used for that purpose since there will be a few new members. Board members expressed enthusiasm for that idea.

Dave and Larry wished everyone a great Thanksgiving and a very happy holiday season.

Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 7:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Denise Culman
Recording Secretary

Please check off your name, Sign In Sheet

Workforce Development Board

Roll Call Vote	Please Check	Name	Outside Affiliation	WDB Representation
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	1. Adams, David	Owner/Operator, Bear Lake Hardware	Business/Manistee
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2. Bachmann, Eric	Supervisor, MI Rehab. Services	Rehabilitation
	<input type="checkbox"/>	3. Barnard, Jim	Owner, Barnard Engineering	Business/Antrim
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4. Bollman, Ken	President, Saber Tool Company	Business/Wexford
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5. Breithaupt, Tino	VP, Traverse City Chamber of Commerce	Economic Development
	<input type="checkbox"/>	6. Case, Corey	Business Representative, United Asso. Plumbers & Steamfitters Local 85	Labor
	<input type="checkbox"/>	7. Crum, Gretchen	Personnel Director, Boyne USA	Business/Emmet
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	8. Dillon, Charles	President, West Shore Community College	Post Secondary Ed
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	9. Dunbar, Joanne	Employee Relations Manager, Martin Marietta	Business/Manistee
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	10. Eichberger, Don	Manager, H.W. Jencks Inc.	Business/Benzie
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	11. Fedus, Gary	President, Mitchell Graphics	Business/Benzie
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	12. Jeannot, Art	Owner, Platte Lake Resort AMPS Investments LLC	Business/Benzie
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	13. Kalchik, Nathan	Project Manager, Kal Excavating Co	Business/Leelanau
	<input type="checkbox"/>	14. Kaminski, Gene	H.R. & V. P., Northern Michigan Hospital	Business/Emmet
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	15. Korthase, Jane	Human Resource Dir. Grandvue Medical Care Facility	Business/Charlevoix
	<input type="checkbox"/>	16. Mitchell, Laura	Human Resource Manager, Wayne Wire Cloth Products	Business/Kalkaska
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	17. Osborne, Ken	VP Manufacturing, Boride Engineered Abrasives	Business/Gr.Traverse
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	18. Parkes, Doug	Manistee County School Board	K12 Education
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	19. Perdue, Steve	Exec. Director GTP Industries Inc.	Community Based Org.
abstained	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	20. Peters, Sue	VP/Human Resources Munson	Business/Grand Traverse
	<input type="checkbox"/>	21. Pettibone, Christine	Kalkaska Screw Products	Business/Kalkaska
	<input type="checkbox"/>	22. Pratt, David	Deputy Warden, Pugsley Correctional Facility	Community Corrections
	<input type="checkbox"/>	23. Rives, Jerald	President, Elk Lake Tool Co.	Business/Antrim
	<input type="checkbox"/>	24. Ryan, Martha	Owner, Martha's Leelanau Table	Business/Leelanau
	<input type="checkbox"/>	25. Smith, Jim	NMC/ Tool North, Inc.	Students
	<input type="checkbox"/>	26. Toth, John	President, Central Labor Council	Labor
	<input type="checkbox"/>	27. Van Houten, Dave	Director, Wexford/Missaukee	DHS
Y	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	28. Ward, Pam	Director, Child Care Connections	Business/Gr.Traverse

November 8, 2010

Joint board meeting

Others
Please Print **Legibly**

	Name	Organization
1.	Charles Koop	Antrim County Civil Counsel
2.	Elaine Wood	NWMCOG staff
3.	Denise Culman	NWMCOG staff
4.		
5.		
6.		
7.		
8.		
9.		
10.		
11.		
12.		
13.		
14.		
15.		
16.		
17.		
18.		
19.		
20.		
21.		
22.		
23.		
24.		

*Please
check off your name*

Sign In Sheet

Council of Governments Board

			Roll Call Vote	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	1.	Crawford, Mike	Antrim County	Y
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	2.	Tanner, Donald	Benzie County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	3.	Christensen, Chris	Charlevoix County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	4.	Atchison, Les	Emmet County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	5.	Inman, Larry	Gr. Traverse County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	6.	Nemeth, Louis	Kalkaska County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	7.	Watkoski, Jean	Leelanau County	Y
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	8.	O'Shea, Allen	Manistee County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	9.	Rogers, Susan	Missaukee County	N
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	10.	Copley, Larry	Wexford County	N

Others - Sign In Here

#	Name	Organization
1	Charles Koop	Antrim County Counsel
2		
3		
4		
5		
6		
7		
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		